

REPORT  
OF THE  
ROYAL COMMISSION  
ON THE  
PILOTAGE DISTRICTS OF MIRAMICHI,  
SYDNEY, LOUISBOURG, HALIFAX, ST. JOHN,  
MONTREAL AND QUEBEC

*PRINTED BY ORDER OF PARLIAMENT*



OTTAWA

J. DE LABROQUERIE TACHÉ  
PRINTER TO THE KING'S MOST EXCELLENT MAJESTY  
1919



[104]

**REPORT of the Royal Commission Appointed to inquire into and report upon conditions in the Pilotage Districts of Miramichi, Sydney, Louisburg, Halifax, St. John, Montreal and Quebec, and to recommend, if necessary, any changes found desirable.**

1918.

MONTREAL, September 10, 1918.

SIR,—We have the honour to submit to you the following report in connection with the pilotage districts of Miramichi, Sydney, Louisburg, St. John, Montreal and Quebec, in addition to the report already presented to you dealing with the pilotage district of Halifax.

At the outset your commissioners wish to reiterate the statements made in the report regarding the Halifax Pilotage district, as to the scope of our investigations under the Orders in Council under which we were appointed, and to say that we have guided ourselves, in conducting our inquiries into the above-mentioned districts, by the procedure followed in Halifax.

During the twelve open sessions of the commission, in respect of the various districts hereinbefore mentioned, ninety-six witnesses were examined, including, as in Halifax, the local commissioners, steamship owners, steamship agents, shipmasters, naval and Government officials, pilots and apprentices, and important evidence has been adduced having reference to the respective districts.

Among those appearing before the commission were Messrs. W. B. Snowball, J. P. Burchell, M.L.A., and F. E. Neale, at Chatham; Lieutenant Wood, Joseph Salter, steamship agent; F. Fitzgerald, of the Dominion Coal Company; F. C. Barrington, of the Nova Scotia Steel Company, and Capt. Ronald MacDonald, at Sydney; Dr. D. A. Morrison; Lieut. J. C. Caine, Capt. J. E. Evans; Capt. J. E. Morry, and William E. McAlpine, of the Dominion Coal Company, at Louisburg; Commander G. O. E. Elliott; James B. Russell; Capt. John Hall; Capt. G. C. Evans; Capt. Isaac Evans; Capt. Ames Potter; H. C. Schofield; J. W. Smith; J. C. Chesley, agent Marine Department; R. W. Blennerhassett, of Canadian Pacific Ocean Services; R. C. Elkin; H. E. Wardroper; and D. W. Ledingham, of Messrs. William Thomson Company, steamship agents, at St. John; Messrs. R. W. Reford, president, Robert Reford Company; John Torrance, manager of White Star Lines; W. H. Duthie and G. J. Madden, of Canada Steamship Lines, and Canada Shipping Company, respectively; Capt. P. L. Lachance, and Alberic Angers, president of Montreal Pilots Association, at Montreal; and Capt. Lachance, J. B. Bernier and Ph. Lamontagne, of the Quebec Corporation of Pilots, at Quebec.

The commission wishes to record its full appreciation of the cheerfulness and willingness exhibited by the various witnesses who appeared before it, in testifying, and the help they have rendered to the commission in every respect. The number and extreme importance of the exhibits submitted have occasioned a thorough and careful review which has occupied considerable time.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

## MIRAMICHI DISTRICT.

The inquiry into the Miramichi Pilotage district was opened on March 8, 1918, in the board room of the Chatham town hall, which was very courteously placed at our disposal by Mayor W. B. Snowball, and continued on March 9, to permit of the attendance of Mr. J. P. Burchell, M.L.A., a member of the local pilotage commission, when the hearing of oral evidence in respect of this district was concluded.

## ADMINISTRATION.

It affords your commissioners great pleasure to say that, judging from the minute books submitted by the secretary of the Miramichi Pilotage district, the records of the district have been well kept. The minute books presented to us cover a space of 25 years, from January 18, 1893, to March 8, 1918. It appears from the minute books that meetings of the commissioners have been held once or twice a year; that in December, 1893, there were thirty-nine pilots in this district, with four pilot schooners; that from 1900 to 1910, inclusive, there were twenty branch pilots, with three pilot schooners; while in 1911 there were nineteen pilots; that from 1912 to 1917 there were sixteen branch pilots and one apprentice, with the exception of 1913, when there were seventeen branch pilots. This reduction in number of pilots has come about naturally owing to the change from sail to steam.

## PILOTS.

While your commissioners were very favourably impressed with the branch pilots who appeared before us about eleven in number—we found that four of the sixteen pilots at present in this district were over 70 years of age, nine over 60 years, and under 70, while the remaining three were between 50 and 60. Whilst it may be said that the branch pilots of this district are, as a whole, apparently a strong, able-bodied class of men, and well preserved for their ages, we feel that no one should be permitted to act as a pilot who is over 70 years of age.

## APPRENTICES.

In the Miramichi Pilotage district the apprentice pilots have, in the past, been indentured for four years, and the only apprentice at present in this district is engaged on board of the pilot schooner *Admiral Beatty*, in running the gasoline engine, etc.

The first two years of the apprenticeship the apprentice serves as a member of the crew of the pilot schooner, and the remaining two years the apprentice pilot is supposed to accompany the pilots; but no apprentice pilot is permitted to pilot a vessel until he receives his branch. The present apprentice is paid \$20 per month. He has had no sea service other than that which he obtained on board the pilot schooner in the capacity above mentioned.

## PILOT SCHOONERS.

Up to the fall of 1917 there were two pilot schooners in this district the *Admiral Beatty*, owned by eleven of the pilots, and the *Mabel*, owned by the remaining five pilots. The latter vessel was lost during last fall.

The *Admiral Beatty* is an auxiliary schooner, having a gasoline engine, of about 50 tons gross, 72 feet over all, 18 feet 4 inches beam, and 8-foot depth, with a speed of about 8 knots, and has accommodation for eleven pilots and three apprentices. This vessel was built in 1916, for eleven of the pilots, at a cost of \$6,350.

Your commissioners availed themselves of the opportunity of visiting this vessel, which is at the present time the only one engaged as a pilot tender in this district.

Since the loss of the *Mabel* some of the pilots are without means of earning their living, owing to not having a vessel of their own, or shares in the *Admiral Beatty*.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

## EYESIGHT AND HEARING TEST.

It appears that no proper tests of the eyesight or hearing of the pilots or apprentices were made, the practice followed in the past being for the pilots to visit a local optician and obtain a certificate from him for presentation to the local commissioners annually, while occasionally one of the commissioners would conduct an informal test.

## POOLING OF EARNINGS.

From the evidence it would seem that the system of pooling the earnings was first adopted in this district in 1882, and is continued at the present time. Deductions are made from the earnings of the respective pilots to pay for their shares of the cost and maintenance of the pilot schooners. This explains the fact of the earnings varying in the annual returns submitted to the Marine Department.

## PENSION FUND.

In 1882 it appears that a club was founded amongst the pilots with the idea of forming a superannuation fund; but as it was not unanimous the scheme did not develop. The pilots have assisted each other during illness, by not making any deductions, granting full shares of earnings in respective cases, and have made allowances for widows of deceased pilots for short periods; but this latter practice has had to be discontinued owing to lack of funds. It is to be regretted that no provision has been made for superannuating pilots in their declining years.

## NUMBER OF PILOTS.

It would seem, from the evidence, that there are too many pilots in this district at the present time. The evidence from the shipping interests and pilots themselves was unanimous that twelve pilots would be sufficient to meet the requirements of the trade of the ports.

In 1916 the income to each pilot was about \$900; in 1917 the income to each pilot was \$275, and after paying expenses they had only about \$150 left. The average income in ordinary years was about \$750.

## LOUISBURG PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

The commission held open sittings in Louisburg during the morning and afternoon of March 13, 1918, in the town hall, which was very kindly placed at our disposal by Mayor W. E. McAlpine.

## ADMINISTRATION.

The first witness examined was Mr. E. G. Whitman, who is secretary-treasurer of the Louisburg Pilotage commission, as well as a member of the said commission. Mr. Whitman produced his minute books covering the proceedings of the commission from the time he was appointed secretary-treasurer, the first entry contained therein being June 18, 1917, and the last entry, September 5, 1917. He was unable to produce the records previous to his appointment owing to the former secretary, Capt. Thomas Townsend, not having handed same over to the local commission, although he was requested to do so both by the Department of Marine and Fisheries, and the Louisburg Pilotage commissioners. As the records submitted by Mr. Whitman cover such a short period we are unable to pass any opinion as to whether or not the records were properly and efficiently kept previous to his taking office.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

## PILOTS.

There are at present eight licensed pilots in this district, four of whom possess certificates as masters in the coasting trade, and whose ages range from 47 to 57. Four of the eight pilots appeared before your commissioners to give evidence, and created a very favourable impression on our minds, in respect of intelligence and ability.

## APPRENTICES.

There are no apprentice pilots in this district, nor have any definite arrangements apparently been made in this respect. The weight of the evidence was to the effect that any vacancies which might exist in the future in the list of branch pilots could always be filled from local shipmaster and others with practical sea experience and knowledge of the district. This has been the course followed in the past, and appears to have proven highly satisfactory.

## PILOT BOATS.

There are apparently eight pilot row-boats in this district, in addition to a gasoline launch, 42 feet 9 inches over all, which is used for boarding vessels outside. The launch appears to answer all requirements, except when ice conditions render navigation for such a small vessel difficult.

## PILOTS' SHORE STATION.

In Louisburg the pilots have a shore station about one mile from the International pier, by water, at the entrance to the harbour. The property upon which the pilots have erected their building is leased from the Kennealy estate for \$10 per annum.

## EYESIGHT AND HEARING TESTS.

There does not appear to have been any tests of the eyesight or hearing of the pilots of this district at any time.

## PILOTS' EARNINGS.

Prior to the war the earnings of the pilots in the Louisburg district were apparently very small. In 1913-14 the pilots' average earnings were \$593.50; but in 1914-15 they increased to \$818.47; and in 1915-16 amounted to \$1,187.33; while in 1916-17 they averaged \$1,607.61. By taking one week off duty, turn about, the pilots have been enabled to supplement their earnings by fishing, etc., four pilots being on duty and four off each week, and it appears that under this system there have always been a sufficient number of pilots on duty to meet the requirements of the trade of the port. The winter months are of course the busiest for the pilots of this district, the port of Louisburg practically handling the trade of Sydney for that period.

## PENSION FUND.

There has been no provision made for the retirement of pilots in this district in the way of deductions from the earnings so as to form a superannuation fund.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

## SYDNEY PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

The sittings of the commission in this district extended over three days, March 11, 12 and 14, 1918, and the conditions existing here were not found to be quite as good as those in the Miramichi and Louisburg districts. The evidence of twenty-three witnesses, representing the various interests concerned in this district, was obtained.

## ADMINISTRATION.

Mr. F. C. Kimber, who is secretary-treasurer of the Sydney Pilotage authority, as well as a commissioner, produced his records, which were found to have been kept in a very satisfactory manner.

On page thirty-three of the minute book, under date of October 6, 1913, it appears that the secretary reported the unsatisfactory state of Collector R. T. J. Vooght's accounts, and that Mr. Vooght, who was also a commissioner, asked for time to adjust same.

On page 45, December 31, 1913, Commissioner Vooght undertook to have the North Sydney collections straightened out by January 10, 1914.

This matter apparently dragged along until April 14, 1915, when the commissioners passed a resolution as follows: "That in view of the unsatisfactory manner in which the collectorship at North Sydney has been handled during the past two seasons, and in the interests of the pilotage service generally, the board of commissioners do not feel justified in reappointing Commissioner Vooght as collector for the ensuing year without exacting from him satisfactory securities for the proper and faithful discharge of his duties as such collector, and the Board, therefore, instruct the Secretary to notify Mr. Vooght that unless he can, on or before the 30th of April, furnish two substantial bondsmen satisfactory to the board, some other appointment will have to be made."

On May 28, 1915, the resignation of Mr. Vooght as collector of pilotage at North Sydney was read and accepted. Then again, on page 91, under date of November 25, 1915, the following entry appears: "This meeting was called to consider what action the authority should take in regard to the action threatened by heirs of ex-pilot the late George Brown for recovery of pilotage due to him. Pilot Richardson having explained that the money, amounting to \$155.75, had been left with Mr. R. T. J. Vooght until it was known to whom the money was legally payable, it was decided that the money should be paid by the secretary and deducted from Mr. Vooght's salary as commissioner. The secretary was instructed to be careful in paying the money to ascertain that it was paid to the proper party or parties."

It appears that Commissioner Vooght had been requested on several occasions to pay this money over; but up to the date he appeared before this commission—14th March, 1918—he had not settled this account.

When on the stand he admitted that the money was still due; but stated that he had arranged to refund it at the end of this year, out of his salary as commissioner. The only explanation he had to offer when asked by the chairman: "Q. Don't you think that it is a wrong action on the part of a commissioner? You are supposed to look after the control of the pilots."—was "A. I fancy it was; but at the time it was an obligation for me—that is the only explanation I have to offer."

Mr. Vooght was ordered by the chairman to refund this money at once, and we are pleased to be able to advise you that in a communication from the secretary-treasurer of the district it is stated that the matter has now been settled.

This, and other instances, confirms your commissioners' views of the necessity of doing away with local influence or control and the supervision and management of this and other districts being placed under a Government department.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

An unusual state of affairs appears to exist in the district in the appointment of collectors at North Sydney and the International pier—who appear to collect the pilotage dues and hand same over to the secretary-treasurer for distribution to the pilots.

The collector at North Sydney was last year paid \$600, besides \$100 for office rent, while the collector at the International Pier is in receipt of an annual allowance of \$250, and was granted a gratuity of \$250 last year, making in all a sum of \$1,200, which has been deducted from the earnings of the pilots for this purpose.

In the annual statement of the district for 1917 there appears an item of \$3,598.98 for expenses, and from exhibits produced for the months of May, July and August, it is apparent that a large proportion of these expenses are made up of gratuities to masters of vessels visiting this port.

The commissioners of this district each receive \$150 per year for their services, while the superintendent of pilots receives \$250, in addition to his share as a pilot, and the secretary-treasurer is in receipt of \$500 per year, plus his allowance as commissioner.

It appears that a finance committee, consisting of three pilots, meets the secretary-treasurer on the 10th of each month to discuss the previous month's business, and decide on the division of the earnings amongst the pilots and apprentices, and settlement of accounts.

#### PILOTS.

In 1917 there were thirty branch pilots in this district, these being divided into two shifts, each shift working one week in turn; but in cases where extra pilots were required the shift off duty appears to have been called upon and to have answered the call readily.

Four of the pilots are stationed at the International Pier, two at North Sydney, two for the vessels plying the Bras D'Or lakes and the balance divided between the two stations at Low Point and Lloyd's Cove.

The pilots for the lake vessels remain on board of these steamers, having permission from the pilotage authority to do so, and apparently receive a separate remuneration from the owners of these vessels for duties performed outside of the district, besides receiving their share of the pool of earnings for pilotage in the district. It might be said that some of the pilots have little or no knowledge of the chart, and it is apparent that they perform their duties under very crude methods.

#### APPRENTICE PILOTS.

According to the evidence of Superintendent of Pilots Barrington, there are eight apprentice pilots, who are appointed, apparently, through political patronage, and who, after being required to serve two years in the pilotage service, are supposed to have one season of sea service.

Some of the present apprentice pilots have been over five years in the service, one of them being over fifty years of age. These apprentices receive half of a pilot's share of earnings, which last year amounted to as high as \$871.52 per apprentice. This is considered by your commissioners to be a most unusual and unnecessary tax upon shipping, and so far as we could learn there does not seem to be any actual service given in return for this remuneration, by the apprentices, the only duties they perform being about the pilot stations and pilot boats.

One of the apprentice pilots examined by your commissioners appears to have served three years in the pilotage service, and to be totally ignorant of the duties of a pilot. He cannot steer a vessel, has no knowledge of the chart or lead line, and during his service has only made seven trips with a pilot. Another apprentice pilot who has been ten months in the service is equally backward in knowledge of the chart and gasoline tender.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

These apprentices on the whole appear to be the makings of good and efficient pilots if properly trained; but from the evidence adduced it is apparent that the branch pilots do not take the slightest interest in them, in so far as assisting them to become acquainted with the pilotage district of Sydney. The only duties they perform appear to be in connection with the embarking and disembarking of the pilots by means of gasolene tender.

## PILOT BOATS.

The pilots have one gasoline launch, 35 feet overall, 8-foot beam which has no sleeping accommodation, and two small boats. The launch, which is manned by the pilots and apprentices, cost the pilots about \$1,200.

## EYESIGHT AND HEARING TESTS.

Previous to 1917 it appears that no regular examination of the eyesight and hearing of the pilots and apprentices was conducted; but it seems that an annual eyesight and hearing test has been decided upon in this district, as a result of a recommendation made by the Dominion Wreck Commissioner in his finding, following an investigation into the stranding of a steamer in Sydney harbour whilst in charge of a branch pilot.

## PENSION FUND.

Two and a half per cent is deducted from the earnings of the pilots for the purpose of providing a fund for superannuating the pilots and granting allowances to widows and children of deceased pilots, and on the 31st of December, 1917, there were \$213.20 in the savings bank besides an investment of \$4,000 in Victory Bonds.

## NUMBER OF PILOTS.

It appears from the evidence obtained that there are too many pilots in this district, and a petition has been presented to this commission, signed by a number of the pilots who were present at the time suggesting that the number of pilots be reduced to twenty-six, and the number of apprentice pilots to four.

## ST. JOHN DISTRICT.

The inquiry opened on March 20, 1918, at the Board of Trade rooms, which were kindly placed at our disposal by the Board of Trade. Twenty-seven witnesses were examined, the first being Mr. J. U. Thomas, secretary-treasurer of the district, who is not a commissioner.

The Chairmanship is at present vacant owing to the death of Mr. James E. Cowan, —the board now consisting of six commissioners and the secretary.

It was found that pilotage in St. John is divided into three districts, as follows:—

1st district: from Partridge island to Musquash head, bearing NW;

2nd district: from Musquash head to point Lepreaux, NW;

3rd district: from the outside limit of the second district to a point ranging from the North Head of Grand Manan to Liberty point bearing NW. by N, north channel,—and from Machias Seal Island to cape Sable, Seal island, bearing SSE, south channel.

The secretary submitted three minute books the first entry bearing date August 11, 1874, which records the first official meeting of the St. John Pilot Commissioners. These books have been regularly kept and the last entry is dated March 1, 1918.

We found, on carefully examining these minute books, that a large number of disputes between pilots and masters of vessels as to the liability of vessels reported

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

to the secretary as having been spoken within the pilotage limits, and which had later picked up another pilot. We learned that an enormous amount of the commissioners' time had been taken up in settling these disputes. It appears from the minute books produced that in many instances meetings were called, and owing to inability to obtain a quorum the meetings were cancelled.

The total earnings of the pilots in 1917 were \$35,681.37, the deductions for pension fund and other expenses amounting to \$4,442.37, leaving a balance of \$31,239 for distribution to pilots, who defray the expenses of boats, etc., which Pilot Doherty stated average nearly \$100 per month per man. While it is stated in evidence that the earnings of each boat are divided amongst the pilots share and share alike, the annual returns to the Department of Marine, do not show any two pilots receiving similar amounts.

#### PILOT SCHOONERS.

There are two pilot schooners for this district, the *Howard D. Troop*, which is 105 feet over all, 23 foot beam, 69 tons net, with accommodation for six pilots and four of a crew, having auxiliary engines, with a speed of about 8 knots, valued in 1916 at \$9,800, and was built in 1896. The *David Lynch*, also an auxiliary vessel, was valued at \$6,600. These valuations are taken from a minute under date of 1st September, 1916, and were arrived at by an appraiser. These two pilot boats work in opposition to each other and are owned by the pilots only—the commissioners having no interest in them.

According to the by-laws of the district every licensed pilot is required to be the registered owner of not less than four tons of a licensed pilot boat in actual service. Notwithstanding the above provision it has been customary in the past, where a man does not actually own the required share in a pilot boat, to give him what is known as a flag share, which permits him to use a small boat for boarding vessels.

There is at the present time one pilot who is unable to use this flag as the commissioners would not grant the necessary permission. This pilot has been 20 years in the service, and had shares in a pilot boat, the *David Lynch*, the mortgage on which was foreclosed, and he has been unable up to the present to purchase another share or shares in a pilot boat, even after the *David Lynch* was re-purchased by five pilots, and he is, therefore, not in a position to act as a pilot.

#### PILOTS.

There are at present fourteen branch pilots here, one of whom is 72 years of age, and two others are above 65 years.

#### APPRENTICES.

There are four apprentice pilots in the St. John Pilotage district between 18 and 19 years of age. We were unable to have any of these apprentice pilots before us as they were all at sea on the pilot boats. These apprentice pilots are indentured to individual pilots, having to serve under such pilots for five years, besides having to serve as seaman on a square-rigged vessel for two European trips or on trip to South America; but may be permitted to serve on a steamer, at the discretion of the pilotage authority, and are in receipt of \$10 per month. They have no means of supplementing their earnings when serving on the pilot schooners.

#### POOLING OF EARNINGS.

We find, from the evidence given, that each pilot boat pools its pilotage earnings, which are divided between the pilots who own shares in her and work for her.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

## PENSION FUND.

The evidence of the secretary is to the effect that the pension fund invested on December 31, 1917, amounted to \$17,684.69. seven per cent is deducted from the pilots' earnings, as well as 25 cents per foot draught on the outward pilotage, the balance from which, after paying office expenses and salary of secretary, is paid or credited to the pension fund.

Pilot Rogers in his evidence expressed dissatisfaction as to the manner in which the pension fund had been administered.

## PILOTAGE AUTHORITY.

The weight of the evidence submitted is to the effect that the pilotage authority for the district of St. John should be invested in the Minister of Marine and Fisheries. This appeared to be the unanimous opinion of both pilots and commissioners.

## PILOT STATION.

It was first proposed by Captain Bennett, a commissioner for the district, and approved by the majority of the witnesses, that the three existing districts should be discontinued and that one central station should be adopted where a steam pilot tender shall cruise. The following are the proposed bearings for this station:—

Musquash Point light bearing NW. magnetic, Cape Spencer light E. by N. magnetic, distance 8 miles from Partridge island.

## RECOMMENDATIONS.

## MIRAMICHI DISTRICT.

With respect to the Miramichi district we have the honour to make the following special recommendations:—

1. That the administration has been found to have been very satisfactory.

2. That the condition of the pilotage in this district has been found to be exceptional and the earnings of the pilots during the year 1917 have been exceedingly low, owing to the falling off of deal shipments by water, from the ports in this district. That it is most urgent that something should be done whereby the individual earnings of these pilots may be increased, and with this in view we strongly recommend that the number of pilots be reduced so as not to exceed twelve, and to accomplished this aim will require the retirement of four of the oldest pilots, whose ages range from 71 to 74. The enforced retirement of these men your commissioners consider will entail a certain hardship as they are well preserved and still active. Having these conditions in mind we recommend that some compensation be made to these men annually, to a sum not exceeding \$300, for the remainder of their lives; but this shall be understood not to extend to any pilots who may hereafter be retired in this district. This will be in line with the precedent created by the Marine Department in the Quebec Pilotage district when reducing the number of pilots in that district a few years ago.

3. That in order to assist and keep up a pilotage service, the commissioners recommend that the present pilot vessel *Admiral Beatty* (which is considered a very suitable vessel and practically new) be taken over from the pilots and the expenses of operating be assumed by the department until such time as the average income of the pilots amounts to \$750 per annum. Unless something is done, in the opinion of your commissioners, it will not be possible for the pilotage service to be maintained. The district is an important one and your commissioners feel that it warrants assistance at this time, without creating any precedent, in view of the exceptional circumstances.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

4. That an additional five per centum per annum be deducted from the gross earnings of the pilots of this district for the purpose of creating and maintaining a superannuation fund for the pilots retiring in the district.

#### RE SYDNEY PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

We have the following special recommendations to make with respect to the Sydney Pilotage district:—

1. That the system at present in vogue in this district, for the collection of pilotage dues by collectors stationed at North Sydney and International Pier be at once discontinued. That all pilotage dues be required to be paid to the collectors of Customs at North Sydney and Sydney, who should be responsible to the pilotage authority, and who should not grant clearance to any ship until such pilotage dues are paid, or satisfactory arrangements made for payment thereof.

#### *Pilot Tender.*

2. That a steam pilot tender be provided for this district, with accommodation for twelve pilots. That this vessel be used for the Louisburg Pilotage district in the late winter and early spring when ice conditions prevail and Sydney harbour is closed.

That seven and one-half per cent of the gross earnings of the pilots of the Sydney Pilotage district be deducted annually to be applied towards the upkeep and running expenses of this steam pilot tender. That the pilots be required to pay for meals on board the tender at a rate to be fixed by the superintendent.

3. That the pension fund should be taken over and managed by the Minister of Marine and Fisheries, and, as at present, five per cent be deducted from the pilotage earnings to be applied in this connection, as well as any receipts from white flag licenses which may be issued, and any fines which may be imposed.

4. That the number of pilots in this district is excessive, and we recommend that no more pilots be engaged so long as the number of pilots for this district exceeds twenty. It is, of course, understood that the number of pilots shall not be reduced until the present apprentice pilots are branched. The twenty pilots are in our opinion sufficient to answer the requirements of the trade of this district.

5. That each of the present apprentice pilots in this district be required to accompany a branch pilot on at least fifty round trips each year.

6. That no further apprentice pilots be appointed in this district. (See General Recommendations.)

#### LOUISBURG PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

We desire to make the following recommendations specially effecting this district:—

1. That during the late winter and early spring, when ice conditions prevail in this district, the steam tender already recommended for the Sydney Pilotage district be used for the Louisburg Pilotage district. That five per cent of the gross earnings of the pilots of this district be deducted—during the time the tender is used in this service—to be applied towards the upkeep and running expenses of such tender. That the pilots be required to pay for meals on board said tender at a rate to be fixed by the superintendent, similar to the Sydney district.

2. That five per cent of the gross earnings of the pilots of this district be deducted yearly for the purpose of creating and maintaining a superannuation fund for retired pilots.

#### ST. JOHN PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

With respect to the St. John Pilotage district, we have the following special recommendations to make, in addition to our general recommendations:—

1. That the three pilotage districts as at present constituted under this authority be immediately abolished, and that one district be formed, the outside limit of same to be the cruising ground of the pilot tender recommended hereafter.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

2. That a steam pilot tender be provided for the purpose of embarking and disembarking the pilots at the outside limit of the above district at all times, to cruise on the following bearings: Musquash Point light bearing NW. magnetic; Cape Spencer light E. by N. magnetic, distance 8 miles from Partridge island.

3. That the combined rates of the present three pilotage districts be divided by three to form a new rate for the district proposed above.

This would make a fair and equitable rate for the new district, and, according to the evidence submitted, would meet with the approval of all interested parties. The adoption of the above recommendations, and putting same into practice, would do away with the present system of having three districts, and charging three separate and distinct rates, besides enabling masters of vessels inward bound to know just where to secure the pilots. This would also put an end to the disputes which have arisen in connection with the competitive arrangement which now exists, whereby a ship may be called upon to pay two pilotages, owing to not taking a pilot who claims to have offered his services first, and not being seen by the ship.

### GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS RE QUEBEC AND MARITIME PROVINCES PILOTAGE DISTRICTS.

We have the honour to make the following recommendations in connection with the pilotage districts in Quebec and the Maritime Provinces.

1. That the commissions at present administering the pilotage service in the districts of Miramichi, Sydney, Louisburg and St. John have been found by your commissioners to have outrun their usefulness, and we recommend the immediate enactment of legislation appointing the Minister of Marine and Fisheries the pilotage authority for these districts.

2. That it is urgent that a superintendent, having sea-going experience, with a clean record, should be immediately placed in full charge of the Sydney and Louisburg districts combined. That a superintendent with like qualifications be appointed for the district of St. John, and that he be supplied with a qualified assistant for the Miramichi district, such assistant to be responsible to the superintendent of the St. John district, who shall have charge of the St. John and Miramichi districts. That the foregoing officials be immediately placed in full charge of the respective districts, to re-organize and administer their affairs, and be directly responsible to the Minister of Marine and Fisheries. That such superintendents should not have been pilots of the districts mentioned at any time.

3. That the tests for the eyesight and hearing of the pilots, and present apprentices, be conducted on a standard basis, the same system applying in the various districts. That such tests should be held annually in the cases of pilots and apprentices under the ages of 65, and semi-annually in the case of pilots between the age of 65 and 70. That any license granted after a pilot reaches the age of 65 be at the discretion of the minister and that all pilots be compulsorily retired at 70 years. That the system in vogue in the Quebec and Montreal Pilotage districts be adopted, as set forth in by-law 16 of the Montreal Pilotage district, which requires all licensed pilots and apprentice pilots to undergo each year an examination as regards eyesight, colour blindness and hearing, before a medical officer and an officer of the Department of Marine, both selected by the minister, and that sight tests shall be the same as those passed by candidates for masters and mates examinations.

4. That no pilot or apprentice pilot shall be allowed to use intoxicating liquors. That any infraction of this rule be punishable by fine or suspension for the first offence, and dismissal for the second offence.

5. That no intoxicating liquors be permitted to be kept in any pilotage office or on board any pilot tender, or at any pilot station. Any infraction of this rule to entail instant dismissal.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

6. That in respect of the gratuities given by the pilots we reiterate recommendation 23 of our report respecting the Halifax Pilotage district: viz: that the solicitation by a pilot, or the use of any influence by a pilot to secure for himself, or any other pilot, the pilotage of any ship or ships required to pay pilotage or otherwise, or offering any inducement, monetary or otherwise, be strictly prohibited, and any infraction of this to be considered as an offence, and dealt with accordingly.

7. That no pilot be allowed to perform any pilotage duties outside of his own district.

8. That upon the appointment of the superintendents, as hereinbefore recommended, new sets of by-laws be drawn up and adopted, defining their duties, with provisions for the management and conduct of pilots, etc., in the respective districts.

9. That upon any branch pilot attaining the age of 65 years he should be required to hand in his license, and, providing he is able to pass the usual examination as to eyesight and hearing semi-annually, he may be granted a permit enabling him to act as branch pilot until he reaches the age of seventy years, when he should be compulsorily retired.

10. That the systems at present in force in the various Maritime Province Pilotage districts with respect to maintaining apprentice pilots for the purpose of filling vacancies which may occur in the ranks of branch pilots has not been found satisfactory, and we recommend that it be discontinued as soon as the apprentice pilots at present undergoing training have served their time and receive their branch or otherwise cease to become apprentice pilots, and that no further apprentice pilot be engaged. That public notice be given when vacancies arise in the ranks of branch pilots in the various Maritime Province Pilotage districts as well as the Quebec Pilotage district and that an examination of candidates be conducted under proper supervision of an officer of the Marine and Fisheries Department assisted by a Branch Pilot of a standard not lower than that required for a second mate of a sea-going ship, written answers being required to printed questions, and that each candidate be obliged to pass a physical, eyesight and hearing test before final admission to the pilotage service, preference being given to applicants possessing sea-going or coasting certificates, according to grades. It is the intention of your commissioners to have the above recommendation apply to all of the Maritime Province Pilotage districts, as well as the Quebec Pilotage districts; but not to the Montreal Pilotage district, as we feel that Apprentices are necessary in this latter district.

11. That the card system of records at present in use by the Department of Marine and Fisheries in the pilotage districts of Montreal and Quebec, be adopted in the Maritime Province districts, and that the respective superintendents shall see that such is strictly carried out.

12. That the Minister of Marine and Fisheries should take over and manage the pilots' pension funds already created, or which may hereafter be formed. That the pilots of the respective districts be each year asked to appoint one of their number, who, for the time being, shall act in conjunction with the local superintendent or other officer of the department, and make any representations to the department which may be necessary from time to time in connection with the administration of the pilots' pension funds in the respective districts.

13. That after giving consideration to the question of pooling of pilotage earnings, which, in the opinion of your commissioners, tends to maintain a monopoly for a body whose interests are not identical with the best public interests, when they are aware that they get a share of the pool whether they work for it or not, and whose services may not be so readily or cheerfully given as if the employment depended on efficiency and competency and the amount of work obtained depended upon each individual pilot, and after reviewing the different systems in vogue in Canada and elsewhere, and in view of our recommendation that the Minister of Marine and Fisheries become the pilotage authority for all pilotage districts in Canada, your com-

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

missioners recommend that the pilots be put on a salary which can be adjusted to meet the requirements of the local districts. That the pilots be permitted to draw a certain amount per month, the balance being adjusted quarterly, after making deductions for the expenses of the district, and a proportion, not less than 5 per cent, to go towards creating a pension fund. Your commissioners appreciate the difficulty which may arise in handling this matter in districts where there are only a few pilots, and to meet this we recommend that in districts where a pilot's average earnings are over \$2,000, that 25 per cent of such surplus be placed to the credit of a fund to assist the upkeep of the pilotage service in the poorer districts. In fixing the salaries the pilots will require to be taken into the confidence of the department, and local conditions in each district will need to be considered. Your commissioners think that all pilotage services in Canada should be made and supported by the shipping, and should not be a drain on the revenue of the country.

This is but a brief outline of what undoubtedly will be a radical change, and we think if it is handled properly by marine officials who understand the pilots, and who can explain matters to them, there will be no undue difficulty in putting it into operation.

The commission found that the pilots are a bright, intelligent body of men, speaking of them generally, and if it is left to a man such as a shipmaster the Government need have no fear of any trouble arising, and should matters arise they can be referred to the department for adjustment.

No pilot should, of course, be entitled to any share of pilotage rates or other earnings of the pilots in respect of any time which he shall be absent from duty without leave, and in a case of a pilot being off sick, where a medical certificate is provided, he should receive his share for a period not exceeding one month in any year. All pilotage and other earnings should be collected by and paid to the Department of Marine and Fisheries.

14. The question of the tariff has been dealt with in the district reports.

15. At this juncture, as at least a temporary expediency, as the practical questions which arise from day to day in connection with pilotage between the shipping interests and the pilots are of such a nature that they can be dealt with better by a seaman, and thus avoid the time of the minister and deputy minister being taken up with small matters of administration which require practical opinions, we recommend that a practical officer in the department deal with them. The position in the Montreal district is such that the greatest harmony exists between the shipping interests and the pilots, the underwriters also being well satisfied with the department's administration, and if we can have the same conditions established in Quebec your commissioners will feel that the efforts of the Government will be well rewarded, and the stigma which has been hanging over the St. Lawrence pilotage will be removed.

## MONTREAL PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

From the evidence adduced by your Commission it appears that the administration of the Montreal Pilotage district has been carried out in an efficient manner, and in this respect considerable credit must be given to the civil servant who has been handling the records, etc., and followed out the principle introduced by a deceased official, which has been found satisfactory.

One of the questions at issue in this district was a request by the Montreal pilots for an increase in the charges for moving vessels in the harbour of Montreal. The present rate of \$5 for each move was established when Longue Pointe was the outside limit of the harbour of Montreal, and since the extension of the limits as far down as Bout-de-l'Isle the same charge has been made.

After giving the question due consideration and conferring with various shipping interests in connection with the matter we have arrived at the conclusion that the

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

Montreal pilots are deserving of an increase in the premises, and we recommend the following graduated scale:—

For the movage of any ship from Lachine canal to Victoria pier, or any place within that limit, or vice versa, \$5.

For the movage of any inland or lake vessel from Lachine canal to section 50, or vice versa, \$5;

For the movage of any inland or lake vessel from section 50 to the eastern limit of the harbour, or vice versa, \$10;

For the movage of any sea-going ship from any place in the harbour above Victoria pier to section 50, or vice versa, \$10;

For the movage of any sea-going ship from any place above section 50 to Vickers Dry dock, or vice versa, \$15;

For the movage of any sea-going ship from any place above section 50 to the eastern limits of the harbour, or vice versa, \$20;

For the movage of any sea-going ship from any place above section 50 to the Explosive ground, \$15. Should the pilot be detained on board more than 24 hours he shall be paid an additional \$10 per day. This charge will be over and above the ordinary pilotage of the vessel between Montreal and Quebec.

#### *Pooling of Pilots' Earnings in the Montreal District.*

In regard to the pooling of earnings of the pilots in the Montreal district as set out in letter from the Deputy Minister of Marine of July 23, 1918, with enclosure from the secretary of the Montreal Pilots' committee, dated July 18, 1918, the commission went into this matter very fully.

The secretary of the Montreal Pilots' committee quotes the earnings of Pilot Angers as \$1,039.74 for fourteen trips; Pilot A. Perron, as \$985.84 for twenty-eight trips, and Norbert Arcand as \$349.70 for ten trips. These are exceptional cases.

In the first place Pilot Angers referred to is dealing with large ocean liners which are very difficult to handle and require a different class of experience than the vessels handled by Pilots Perron and Arcand, hence the difference in the amount of work and earnings.

In addition, the commissioners attach herewith the earnings of branch pilots in this district from the opening of navigation to July 29, for the years 1915, 1916, 1917 and 1918, and from which it will be seen that the average for 18 special-line pilots for 1918 was \$911.85, and for the 32 "tour-de-role" pilots was \$603.

In 1913, previous to the war, taking a comparison up to July 29, in normal times, the pilots' average earnings amounted to \$1,079.75 for branch pilots and \$643.46 for "tour-de-role" pilots.

Taking normal and present conditions there is little difference, and no reason, in our opinion, to recommend any change in the distribution of the earnings.

It might be stated in fairness that in the year 1916 up to July 29, the line pilots earned an average of \$845.50, and the "tour-de-role" pilots \$750.54. From this it will be seen that since the outbreak of the war the "tour-de-role" pilots (who desire the change) have been making in proportion, circumstances considered, better earnings than the line pilots.

Further, the established lines' representatives are unanimous against any change in the distribution of the earnings, contending that it would interfere with the spirit of enterprise of the pilots in the Montreal district, who look forward to promotion from the "tour-de-role" to the regular lines. The regular pilots undoubtedly make fewer voyages; but the ships they have to handle are larger and more difficult and require the most efficient pilots possible.

The commission finds that there have been fewer vessels coming to the port since the war started, and the gross earnings of the pilotage service are less.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

The president of the pilots' committee in his evidence mentioned that there were too many pilots and the number should be reduced to forty.

Your commissioners are of the same opinion, and recommend that during the war the number of pilots be reduced from fifty to forty, and that permission be given to any of the pilots to enter the Naval Service, or the service of any of the shipping companies, as masters, mates, or in other capacities, or be put in a position to serve their country the same as other citizens have been called upon to do. At the termination of the war these men to be permitted to return to the pilotage service.

This, in your commissioners' opinion, would provide for the falling off in ships and increase the present pilots' earnings sufficiently to meet the cost of living which they have to face at present.

## QUEBEC PILOTAGE DISTRICT.

In connection with the Quebec Pilotage district, we have found that the administration of pilotage affairs have greatly improved since 1913, due, to a great extent, to the adoption of a system of record-keeping similar to that in force in the Montreal Pilotage district.

There does not seem to be any serious complaints from the shipping interests with respect to the actual administration; but unrest appears to have existed amongst the ranks of the branch pilots of this district, which apparently culminated in a legal action being instituted by the Quebec corporation of pilots against one Branch Pilot Joseph Paquet, to recover from the said Pilot Paquet the sum of \$532.78, being pilotage dues which Pilot Paquet collected during the season of 1917, up to July 2.

The corporation of pilots alleged that this money belonged to it under the old law of 1862, while Pilot Paquet alleged in answer that that old law was repealed by 4 and 5 George V, chapter 48, except insofar as the administration of the pilots pension fund was concerned, and that the corporation of pilots had no right to the money in question under the new law and the regulations competently passed.

The allegations of the corporation of pilots were, in the opinion of your commissioners, directly contrary to the intentions of the Department of Marine and Fisheries in accepting the recommendations of the royal commission which investigated pilotage conditions in this district in 1913, which had for their purpose, the abolition of the corporation of pilots and the compulsory system of controlling the earnings of the pilots which had existed in the Quebec district previous to 1913.

Mr. Justice Dorion, of the Superior Court of Quebec, before whom the above case was argued, rendered judgment dismissing action of the corporation of pilots on November 2, 1917.

The corporation of pilots appealed to the Court of King's Bench from the Superior Court judgment, with the result that a majority of this Court rendered judgment reversing the decision of Mr. Justice Dorion, holding that the corporation of pilots is still entitled to receive from the pilots all of their earnings, and to control same.

Subsequent to the latter judgment Pilot Paquet informed this commission, when he appeared before it, that he had been approached, on behalf of the corporation of pilots, with an offer to defray all costs in connection with the action, providing he dropped the case without further appeal, and, owing to lack of funds, although it was directly against his personal views and wishes, Paquet was inclined to accept the offer unless the Government desired to provide the necessary funds to proceed with the matter and make it a test case.

It was with the foregoing knowledge that your commissioners submitted to you an interim report in connection with this case on April 23, 1918, recommending that the Government take up the cudgel on behalf of Pilot Paquet, and provide the requisite funds to carry the case to the highest courts in order to have a definite decision arrived at in the matter, and settle the status of the Act 4 and 5 George V, chapter 48.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

It is understood that, acting on the above recommendation, the Department of Justice has now instituted the necessary proceedings to attain the desired end, and we need not dwell further on the subject, beyond saying that it is to be hoped that some satisfactory conclusion will be reached in the very near future in order to allay the feeling which is undoubtedly growing as a result of the actions of the parties concerned.

*Re Pensions given to Quebec Pilots by Dominion Government.*

In practically every pilotage district inquired into by your commissioners, reference has been made to the exceptional treatment by the Dominion Government of the pilots for and below the harbour of Quebec, especially in respect of the pensions being paid to branch pilots, retiring, through old age or otherwise, above 60 years of age amounting to \$300 in each case, in addition to the \$300 pension to which they are entitled from their private pension fund.

The answer given by your commissioners to those who raised the question, was that the Government had granted these additional pensions in order to reduce the number of pilots from 116 to 75, in 1906, and was advanced as a special inducement to the pilots to retire; but we were met with the argument that the pensions were still being paid to pilots retiring even at present, above 60 years.

Your commissioners have made a thorough study of the departmental records and other references in connection with this vexed question and arrived at the conclusion that there is not the slightest doubt that the intention of the Marine Department in granting these pensions to retired pilots was for the distinct purpose of reducing the number of pilots to a reasonable figure, viz., from 116 to 75, in 1906, and nothing but a strained interpretation of the Order in Council of December 5, 1906, can be advanced in support of continuing the practice once the number of pilots was reduced to seventy-five.

In the opinion of your commissioners, the principle of granting pensions to the pilots who retired after the number had fallen to seventy-five, is absolutely untenable, unless it is extended to apply to retired pilots in the other districts in Canada, and your commissioners recommend that the granting of pensions to retired pilots in the Quebec Pilotage district, while neglecting to deal similarly with the pilotage districts of Montreal, Halifax, Sydney, Miramichi, St. John, Louisburg, Vancouver, Victoria, Nanaimo, and New Westminster, should be discontinued.

In order to alleviate the feeling existing in the other pilotage districts, and to meet out fair and equitable justice your commissioners also recommend that all Pensions granted to retired pilots of the Quebec pilotage district since the number of pilots was reduced to seventy-five, be immediately withdrawn, as there is not the slightest grounds, in the opinion of your commissioners, to justify such an expenditure of the public money of Canada in any special pilotage district.

There is no reason in the world, so far as your commissioners are aware, why the Quebec pilots should be favoured with such a contribution as they are receiving. The Dominion Government does not even provide such a pension for its well deserving civil servants, who are in most cases earning much less salaries, and working under more difficult circumstances than the pilots of this district, and for 12 months each year?

Your commissioners cannot press this point too strongly, and we are certain that you will see the force of the argument put forth, especially in view of the fact that the Quebec Pilots corporation have a pension fund of practically \$100,000 which would seem to be sufficient to provide reasonable pensions to all of the Quebec pilots.

In addition to the two pensions which the pilots retiring in Quebec receive at present, it seems that they are each given \$1,000 upon retiring, and your commissioners are at a loss to understand this grant, and the only explanation given by the secretary of the corporation is that it is for the shares in former pilot boats.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

*Re Expenses, etc., in Quebec District.*

Your commissioners have carefully inquired into the various amounts expended by the Department of Marine and Fisheries in connection with the administration, etc., of the Quebec Pilotage district; also the operating expenses of the Quebec Pilots corporation, and have found that for the fiscal year 1916-17, the following expenditures were made by the Marine and Fisheries Department in this district, exclusive of expenses of operating and maintaining the steam pilot tender *Eureka* at Father Point:—

Salaries.. . . .	\$ 6,269 81
Telephones.. . . .	188 81
Rentals at Quebec, Montreal and Quebec districts.. . . .	1,987 30
Rental at Father Point.. . . .	66 00
Cleaning offices at Quebec.. . . .	165 00
Coal at Quebec.. . . .	86 58
Light at Quebec.. . . .	65 74
Board at Chicoutimi and Father Point.. . . .	3,143 75
	<hr/>
	\$11,973 02

According to the annual returns of the Quebec Pilots' corporation for 1915, 1916 and 1917, the apparent expenses of operation were as follows:—

1915—	
Pilotage collected by corporation.. . . .	\$123,569
" divided amongst pilots.. . . .	112,874
	<hr/>
Apparent expenses.. . . .	\$9,695
1916—	
Pilotage collected by corporation.. . . .	\$115,711
" divided amongst pilots.. . . .	109,463
	<hr/>
Apparent expenses.. . . .	\$6,248
1917—	
Pilotage collected by corporation.. . . .	\$103,563
" divided amongst pilots.. . . .	90,788
	<hr/>
Apparent expenses.. . . .	\$12,775

The apparent cost of operating the corporation of pilots, or difference between earnings and dividends, exclusive of pension fund, is as follows:—

1915.. . . .	\$ 9,695
1916.. . . .	6,248
1917.. . . .	12,775
	<hr/>
Total.. . . .	\$28,718
	<hr/>
Average.. . . .	\$9,572 2/3

As a sample of the expenses of the corporation of pilots, the following is extracted from the annual return of that body for 1917:—

Rent.. . . .	\$ 900 00
General expenses.. . . .	1,130 28
Expense of pilots.. . . .	130 95
Indemnities to directors.. . . .	600 00
Legal advisers.. . . .	711 00
Interdiction.. . . .	195 33
Boat shares of pilots.. . . .	965 50
Secretary-treasurer and assistant.. . . .	1,750 00
Reserve fund.. . . .	549 14

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

The amounts paid by the Marine Department for the board of pilots and apprentices at Chicoutimi and Father Point for the fiscal years 1915-16, 1916-17 and 1917-18, are as follows:—

1915-16	\$ 1,419 25
1916-17	3,143 75
1917-18	6,143 07
	<hr/>
	\$10,706 07

From the foregoing it is apparent that the cost of operating the corporation of pilots is almost equal to the amounts expended by the department in administration, and, therefore, if the pilots are prepared to spend as much as \$12,775 of their earnings for the upkeep of an organization such as the corporation of pilots, aside altogether from the administration of their pension fund, and cost thereof, your commissioners do not see any reason why the Marine Department should be called upon to provide the total funds for its administration of this district, and we therefore recommend for your favourable consideration, the advisability of deducting a certain percentage of the pilotage earnings of this district to be applied towards the cost of administration.

We are of opinion that seven per centum of the gross earnings of this district should be deducted for the above purpose.

Your commissioners are also firmly of the conviction that the distribution of the earnings, handling of the pension funds, etc., of the Quebec pilots, now done by the corporation of pilots at considerable expense to the pilots, as hereinbefore outlined, unnecessarily, can easily and well be attended to by the present staff of the pilotage branch of the Department of Marine and Fisheries at Quebec, without any expense whatever to the Quebec pilots, beyond the seven per centum deduction above mentioned, and without entailing any increase of staff or expenditure to the department, and we feel that this method would be favourably looked upon by the pilots if it were given a fair trial.

Even with the purposed seven per centum deduction, the expense to the Quebec pilots would be less than at present, under the corporation of pilots, and with increased efficiency.

#### *Re Quebec Pilotage Tariff.*

The pilots of the Quebec district have made a request for an increase in the moorage charges for Quebec harbour, and after giving the matter due consideration, we are of opinion that the tariff should be increased to allow \$5 for each moorage on the Quebec or Lévis side of the river, and \$10 for each moorage entailing crossing from the Quebec side to the Lévis side of the harbour, or vice versa.

Your commissioners also recommend that in cases where pilots are employed as such while a ship's compasses are being adjusted in Quebec harbour, they should be allowed \$10.

The Quebec pilots have also asked that the pilotage tariff between Father Point and Quebec be increased to \$5 per foot draught for the whole year round, instead of the four different rates as at present, for various seasons of the year.

From figures compiled by your commissioners, it is apparent that 85 per cent of the pilotage earned in this district, is during the season from May 1 to November 10, or at the rate of \$3.87 per foot draught inward, and \$3.40 per foot draught outward.

The balance of the pilotage is practically earned from November 10 to 19—on rate of \$4.15 inward, and \$4.16 outward—and from November 19 to the end of the season—on the rates of \$6.02 inward and \$5.54 outward.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

In addition to the above rates the shipping companies pay \$12 per trip, each way—or \$24 to the special pilots in the Quebec Pilotage district, and this amounted in 1917, to about \$5,000 extra.

This is, our opinion, a direct contravention of the Canada Shipping Act, and is a pernicious practice which should be stopped immediately.

The Quebec pilots and apprentice pilots are also paid their board whilst waiting for vessels at Father Point and Chicoutimi. In 1917 this amounted to \$6,143.07.

This is another expenditure of public money which your commissioners do not look favourably upon unless similar treatment is meted out to the various other pilotage districts in the Dominion.

In order to meet this situation your commissioners recommend that the pilotage on outward bound vessels—from Quebec to Father Point—between May 1 and November 10, be increased from the present rate of \$3.40 to \$3.65, and that the Quebec pilots and apprentice pilots be required to provide their own board, etc., at Father Point and Chicoutimi; other rates to remain as at present.

Your commissioners feel that with the department administering the distribution of earnings, pension fund, etc., the pilots will find an increase in their dividends, and that the 25-cent increase above provided, will pay for their board, etc., at Father Point and Chicoutimi, and still leave a comfortable increase on the right side of the ledger.

For the reasons given in dealing with the Montreal district, your commissioners are of the opinion and recommend that during the war the number of pilots in the Quebec district should be reduced from sixty-two to fifty—the same ratio as used in connection with the Montreal district—and that permission be given to any of the pilots to enter the Naval Service, or any of the shipping companies as masters, mates or in other capacities, or put in a position to serve their country the same as other citizens have been called upon to do. At the termination of the war these men to be permitted to return to the pilotage service.

This, in your commissioners' opinion would provide for the falling off in ships, and increase the present pilots earnings sufficiently to meet the cost of living which they have to face at present.

*Re Paquet Case.*

The decision in the Paquet case which is now under appeal, if maintained, will take away certain powers which the Minister of Marine and Fisheries, as pilotage authority in the Quebec district, has in connection with the earnings of the pilots, and should the appeal fail it will be necessary to put this matter beyond a doubt so as to give the minister the control that is necessary for the proper administration of the Quebec district.

## SUPERINTENDENT OF PILOTS FOR THE MONTREAL AND QUEBEC DISTRICTS.

On page 8 of the report of the royal commission on pilotage in the Quebec district, 1913, clause 3, reads as follows:—

That the Government should appoint a superintendent of sea-going experience in full charge of the district, to reorganize its affairs, and be directly responsible to the minister. That he should not have been a pilot of the district at any time, and qualified assistants should be appointed as may be found necessary.

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

From the information given to the commission it was found that a superintendent of sea-going experience with a master mariner's certificate had been appointed to this district; but through circumstances which may have been beyond the department, his services were requisitioned for war purposes, and his duties were placed in the hands of the acting superintendent of pilots, who admitted to the commissioners that he had been a member of the Quebec corporation of pilots which has given the Government so much trouble in the past. When asked by your commissioners at the inquiry, he admitted he would still look to the corporation for his pension.

Your commissioners, in view of the report made by the commission above referred to, and the representations that have been made from time to time, consider it would be in the best interest of all concerned to endorse and reiterate the recommendations made in 1913 that a superintendent of sea-going experience who has not been a pilot, be immediately put in charge of the administration of the Montreal and Quebec Pilotage districts. Our reasons we desire not to dwell further on.

*Re Bill 105 (1914).*

Advantage was taken, in the different districts where our inquiries were held, to submit Bill 105, "An Act to consolidate and amend the Canada Shipping Act," which was introduced in the third session of the twelfth Parliament, 4 George V, 1914.

This Bill was not proceeded with in that session, and it was indicated that the matter was to be held over until the termination of the war. In part V. certain amendments to the present Pilotage Act are set out, which, if put in force, would exempt Canadian registered vessels from the payment of pilotage while employed in coasting voyages within certain limits. This amendment was submitted to the respective interests and no serious objections were raised as to it being put in force. In England and in the United States vessels engaged in the coasting trade are exempt from the obligation to pay pilotage. These privileges should be more distinctly defined as it is not clear in Bill 105 that they are to be only applicable to vessels registered and owned in Canada. The Bill also provides for the minister becoming the pilotage authority for all districts in Canada. This amendment would meet our recommendations in regard to the minister becoming the general authority for all pilotage districts in Canada. In the opinion of your commissioners, this Bill, when it is passed by the House and put in force, will meet all requirements and be somewhat similar to that which has been recently put into effect in the United Kingdom.

When all is said and done, pilotage in the United Kingdom has been in equally as bad a muddle as what we have found here, and in going into the pilotage question, not alone of the United Kingdom, but all maritime nations, it appeared to be in an unsatisfactory condition, generally speaking.

In view of the urgency of the question, it might be beneficial if part V of Bill 105, dealing with pilotage, were introduced in the next session of Parliament and put in to force and effect as soon as possible.

Owing to the many cases which may arise in adjusting this report, your commissioners feel that in order to satisfy the pilots and other interests, it would be well if a commission, of not more than three members—including a representative of the minister, as chairman, a representative of the shipping interests, and a representative of the pilots—were appointed to act in an advisory capacity for the minister, for the purpose of making local by-law; settling the limits of pilotage districts; rates of pilotage; regulating pilotage at and for each district; and recommending such by-laws for the approval of the minister, who shall be the pilotage authority.

The commission wishes to record its sincere appreciation of the valuable services rendered by Mr. J. T. Rowan, of the Department of Marine and Fisheries, its secretary.

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

In our inquiries in the different pilotage districts considerable written and oral evidence was adduced, which has thrown a large amount of labour upon Mr. Rowan, and the skill and industry displayed by him in connection therewith has greatly facilitated the preparation of this report.

The commission respectfully submits the foregoing as its report.

We have the honour to be, sir,

Your obedient servants,

THOMAS ROBB.  
*Chairman.*

JAS. N. BALES.  
*Commissioner.*

J. W. HARRISON,  
*Commissioner.*

J. T. ROWAN,  
*Secretary.*

9 GEORGE V, A. 1915

1915—Branch Pilots earnings from the opening of navigation to July 29, 1915 including movages and the number of trips for each one.

No.	Name of Pilot.	Special Pilots.	Tour- de-Role men.	Movages	Total earnings.	No. of Trips.
		\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	
1	Ferdinand Labrecque		638 98	40 00	678 98	17
2	Louis Z. Bonale		614 82	75 00	689 82	16
3	Edmond Gauthier	1,438 00		10 00	1,448 00	20
4	Delvare Nault	1,448 37		10 00	1,458 37	31
5	Wilfred Gauthier	1,449 75		35 00	1,484 75	22
6	Norbert Armand	1,099 32		10 00	1,109 32	28
7	Fernand Bonale		931 03	55 00	986 03	22
8	Wilfred Raymond	916 00		5 00	921 00	15
9	Emile P. Hamon	1,424 23		15 00	1,439 23	32
10	Ferdinand Perrault	523 50		5 00	528 50	9
11	Henri Dessault		689 94	5 00	694 94	14
12	Arthur Brousse	1,258 10		30 00	1,288 10	20
13	Alexis Perrault	1,630 05		20 00	1,650 05	49
14	Emile Dufresne		760 75	80 00	840 75	16
15	Albert Nault		811 87	20 00	831 87	16
16	Napoleon Dessault	776 25		20 00	796 25	12
17	Pierrot Bonale	1,168 67		35 00	1,203 67	30
18	Georges Armand		761 71	80 00	841 71	14
19	Constant Tognon		699 75	40 00	739 75	16
20	Georges Perrault	808 00		10 00	818 00	12
21	Narcisse Bonale	671 00		5 00	676 00	12
22	Joseph Leverde	855 89			855 89	13
23	Seymour Perron	1,268 56			1,268 56	32
24	Albert Angers	814 75			814 75	11
25	Arthur Brousse		817 60	80 00	897 60	18
26	G. Thérèse Hamelin	1,438 28		5 00	1,443 28	31
27	Alfred Perrault		942 89	130 00	1,072 89	24
28	E. N. Raymond		946 66	80 00	1,026 66	23
29	E. Henri Bonale	1,183 38		10 00	1,193 38	29
30	E. Azarias Papout		712 37	55 00	767 37	17
31	E. M. Labrecque		983 40	45 00	1,028 40	22
32	Darius Papout		763 00	65 00	828 00	19
33	E. Arthur Gosselin	1,265 67			1,265 67	29
34	Albert Gosselin		756 69	45 00	801 69	19
35	E. Oswald Frenette	1,026 89			1,026 89	25
36	G. B. Hamelin		852 83	40 00	892 83	19
37	Fernand Perron	906 00		5 00	911 00	15
38	E. Delvare Frenette	616 50			616 50	9
39	Fernand Hamelin	1,382 25		15 00	1,397 25	21
40	E. G. Gauthier	763 75			763 75	12
41	Emile B. Angers		858 70	40 00	898 70	21
42	Edouard J. Perrault	668 40			668 40	9
43	Narcisse Frenette		779 97	40 00	819 97	16
44	Henri Bonale		703 08	15 00	718 08	19
45	Fernand Perron	1,656 46		10 00	1,666 46	49
46	Henri Desjardis	389 60			389 60	7
47	E. Arthur Armand	1,209 14			1,209 14	27
48	E. N. Raymond		769 64	45 00	814 64	17
49	E. A. Maréchal		827 20	50 00	877 20	22
50	Julien Frenette		938 46	65 00	1,003 46	23
		30,066 76	17 560 31	1,415 00	49,072 10	1,021

The average for 25 special pilots is \$1,072.81  
The average for 22 tour-de-role men is 798.19

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

1916—Branch Pilots earnings from the opening of navigation to July 29, 1916, including movages and the number of trips for each one.

No.	Name of Pilot.	Special Pilots.	Tour- de-Role men.	Movages	Total earnings.	No. of Trips.
		\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	
1	Louis Z. Bouille.....		581 47	65 00	646 47	12
2	Laurent Gauthier.....	830 75		15 00	845 75	12
3	Delavoie Nault.....	663 38			663 38	14
4	Wilbrod Gauthier.....	871 50		30 00	901 50	12
5	Norbert Arcand.....	541 09			541 09	13
6	Tancrede Bouille.....		654 70	25 00	679 70	18
7	Wilfrid Raymond.....	909 50		15 00	924 50	14
8	Joseph P. Hurteau.....	736 28			736 28	18
9	Edouard Perreault.....	370 17			370 17	7
10	Honore Dussault.....		517 42	5 00	522 42	10
11	Arthur Briere.....	1,194 18		40 00	1,234 18	21
12	Alexis Perreault.....	1,125 15			1,125 15	33
13	Come Dufresne.....		746 26	65 00	811 26	16
14	Napoleon Dussault.....	1,047 67		60 00	1,107 67	16
15	Aubert Naud.....		810 90	10 00	820 90	15
16	Prudent Bellisle.....	736 45			736 45	14
17	Georges Arcand.....		598 01	45 00	643 01	13
18	Constant Toupin.....		763 75	60 00	823 75	14
19	Georges Perreault.....		651 30	50 00	701 30	15
20	Narcisse Bouille.....	439 50		25 00	464 50	7
21	Joseph Leveille.....	1,108 75		35 00	1,143 75	16
22	S. Perron.....	663 69			663 69	16
23	Alberic Angers.....	825 30		25 00	850 30	13
24	Arthur Belisle.....		750 75	75 00	825 75	14
25	G. Theodule Hamelin.....		803 75	80 00	883 75	15
26	Anthyme Perreault.....		885 84	160 00	1,045 84	22
27	Joseph Raymond.....		848 00	115 00	963 00	15
28	J. Henri Bourassa.....	1,069 62			1,069 62	31
29	E. Azarias Paquin.....		799 60	65 00	864 60	17
30	J. M. Labranche.....		801 75	40 00	841 75	15
31	Damien Paquette.....		838 53	85 00	923 53	14
32	J. Arthur Gariepy.....		846 25	40 00	886 25	16
33	Albert Gagnon.....		754 51	25 00	779 51	16
34	J. Oswald Frenette.....		809 34	55 00	864 34	16
35	C. B. Hamelin.....		837 23	50 00	887 23	16
36	Tancrede Perron.....	1,061 75		75 00	1,136 75	16
37	J. Delavoie Frenette.....	985 25		5 00	990 25	38
38	Fortunat Hamelin.....	917 50		30 00	947 50	15
39	J. Cyriac Gauthier.....	1,032 46		45 00	1,077 46	15
40	John B. Angers.....		799 96	35 00	834 96	20
41	David J. Perreault.....		678 50	25 00	703 50	13
42	Napoleon Lachance.....	868 75		10 00	878 75	12
43	Henri Bouille.....		782 76	75 00	857 76	16
44	Theode Perron.....	1,074 01			1,074 01	31
45	Bona Dussault.....	373 81		5 00	378 81	7
46	J. Arthur Arcand.....		776 75	40 00	816 75	15
47	F. X. Rivard.....		710 88	55 00	765 88	14
48	J. A. Mayrand.....		746 95	120 00	866 95	18
49	Jules Briere.....		731 32	65 00	796 32	17
50	Nap de Villers.....		738 15	100 00	838 15	18
		19,446 51	20,264 63	2,045 00	41,756 14	821

The average of 23 special pilots is \$845.50  
The average of 27 tour-de-role men is 750.54

9 GEORGE V, A. 1919

1917.—Branch Pilots earnings from the opening of navigation to July 29, 1917, including movages and the number of trips for each one.

No.	Name of Pilot.	Special Pilots.	Tour- de-Role men.	Movages	Total earnings.	No. of Trips.
		\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	
1	Louis Z. Bouille.....		961 48	90 00	1,051 48	19
2	Laurent Gauthier.....	1,008 32		40 00	1,048 32	13
3	Delavoie Nault.....		776 23	40 00	816 23	16
4	Wilbrod Gauthier.....	1,005 90		5 00	1,010 90	13
5	Norbert Arcand.....		1,053 73	85 00	1,138 73	18
6	Tancrede Bouille.....		1,004 45	45 00	1,049 45	20
7	Wilfrid Raymond.....	1,051 66		30 00	1,081 66	14
8	Joseph P. Hurteau.....		1,162 30	90 00	1,252 30	22
9	Edouard Perreault.....	308 22		10 00	318 22	5
10	Honore Dussault.....		711 67	25 00	736 67	14
11	Arthur Briere.....	544 11		40 00	584 11	8
12	Alexis Perreault.....	1,211 00		15 00	1,226 00	35
13	Come Dufresne.....		912 37	50 00	962 37	18
14	Aubert Naud.....		981 05	25 00	1,006 05	17
15	Napoleon Dussault.....	1,072 52		15 00	1,087 52	14
16	Prudent Bellisle.....		986 47	125 00	1,111 47	21
17	Georges Arcand.....		1,074 40	55 00	1,129 40	18
18	Constant Toupin.....		576 13	75 00	651 13	10
19	Georges Perreault.....	1,055 78		20 00	1,075 78	14
20	Narcisse Bouille.....	436 87		5 00	441 87	6
21	Joseph Leveille.....	1,181 28		10 00	1,191 28	15
22	Severe Perron.....		998 60	115 00	1,113 60	22
23	Alberic Angers.....	1,049 03		20 00	1,069 03	14
24	Arthur Belisle.....		1,010 91	90 00	1,100 91	16
25	Anthyme Perreault.....		988 44	125 00	1,113 44	22
26	Joseph N. Raymond.....		905 61	75 00	980 61	19
27	J. Henri Bourassa.....	1,260 44		15 00	1,275 44	37
28	E. Azarias Paquin.....		1,050 72	55 00	1,105 72	19
29	J. M. Labranche.....		971 97	45 00	1,016 97	17
30	Damien Paquet.....		951 78	55 00	1,006 77	18
31	J. Arthur Gariépy.....		981 66	85 00	1,066 66	18
32	Albert Gagnon.....		1,003 88	35 00	1,038 88	18
33	J. Oswald Frenette.....		858 84	45 00	903 84	17
34	C. B. Hamelin.....		990 81	40 00	1,030 81	19
35	Tancrede Perron.....	1,321 23		30 00	1,351 23	18
36	J. Delavoie Frenette.....	977 63		30 00	1,007 63	11
37	Fortunat Hamelin.....	1,064 93		10 00	1,074 93	13
38	J. Cyriac Gauthier.....	968 78		35 00	1,003 78	13
39	John B. Angers.....		763 23	75 00	838 23	16
40	David J. Perreault.....		761 65	25 00	786 65	14
41	Napoleon Lachance.....	949 02		15 00	964 02	12
42	Henri Bouille.....		1,027 07	60 00	1,087 07	19
43	Theode Perron.....	1,328 79		100 00	1,428 79	35
44	Bona Dussault.....	428 19			428 19	6
45	J. Arthur Arcand (Sick).....		31 25	5 00	36 25	1
46	F. X. Rivard.....		871 97	45 00	916 97	16
47	Joseph A. Mayrand.....		822 27	100 00	922 27	19
48	Jules Briere.....		846 46	45 00	891 46	17
49	Napoleon de Villers.....		970 73	110 00	1,080 73	19
50	Achille Gosselin.....		746 92	95 00	841 92	17
		18,223 70	27,755 05	2,475 00	48,453 75	832

The average for 19 special pilots is \$959.14  
The average for 31 tour-de-role men is 895.32

## SESSIONAL PAPER No. 104

1918.—Branch Pilots earnings from the opening of navigation to July 29, 1918, including movages and the number of trips for each one.

No.	Name of Pilot.	Special Pilots.	Tour- de-Role men.	Movages	Total earnings.	No. of Trips.
		\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	\$ cts.	
1	Louis Z. Bouille.....		654 69	50 00	704 69	16
2	Laurent Gauthier.....	212 88		5 00	217 88	3
3	Delavoie Nault.....		645 94	55 00	700 94	13
4	Wilbrod Gauthier.....	1,068 44		45 00	1,113 44	14
5	Norbert Arcand.....		538 48	35 00	573 48	13
6	Tancrede Bouille.....		529 44	45 00	574 44	12
7	Wilfrid Raymond.....	954 56		10 00	964 56	13
8	Joseph P. Hurteau.....		788 63	120 00	908 63	20
9	Edouard Perreault.....	755 38		30 00	785 38	11
10	Honore Dussault.....		486 80	30 00	516 80	12
11	Arthur Briere.....	352 35		25 00	377 35	5
12	Alexis Perreault.....	1,133 62		30 00	1,163 62	32
13	Aubert Naud.....		638 11	15 00	653 11	12
14	Napoleon Dussault.....	823 62		20 00	843 62	11
15	Prudent Bellisle.....		782 34	80 00	862 34	17
16	Georges Arcand.....		456 66	55 00	511 66	11
17	Constant Toupin.....		540 78	30 00	570 78	11
18	Narcisse Bouille.....	971 42		55 00	1,026 42	15
19	Joseph Leveille.....	1,004 53		20 00	1,024 53	14
20	Severe Perron.....		602 41	110 00	712 41	17
21	Alberic Angers.....	1,255 33		20 00	1,275 33	17
22	Arthur Belisle.....		607 47	55 00	662 47	13
23	Anthyme Perreault.....		672 84	90 00	762 84	19
24	Joseph N. Raymond.....		627 20	90 00	717 20	17
25	J. Henri Bourassa.....	1,124 44		40 00	1,164 44	32
26	E. Azarias Paquin.....		589 99	65 00	654 99	13
27	J. M. Labranche.....		663 37	45 00	708 37	14
28	Damien Paquet.....		641 65	55 00	696 65	12
29	J. Arthur Gariepy.....		545 21	55 00	600 21	11
30	Albert Gagnon.....		630 36	65 00	695 36	14
31	J. Oswald Frenette.....		651 61	70 00	721 61	16
32	C. B. Hamelin.....		733 35	45 00	778 35	15
33	Tancrede Perron.....	892 13		100 00	992 13	12
34	J. Delavoie Frénette.....	701 74		45 00	746 74	10
35	Fortunat Hamelin.....	1,022 95		60 00	1,082 95	13
36	J. Cyriac Gauthier.....	1,035 68		25 00	1,060 68	14
37	John B. Angers.....		744 87	40 00	784 87	16
38	David J. Perreault.....		75 50	5 00	80 50	2
39	Napoleon Lachance.....		593 01	30 00	623 01	13
40	Henri Bouille.....		796 89	50 00	846 89	17
41	Theode Perron.....	1,112 69		65 00	1,177 66	33
42	Bona Dusseault.....	895 47		65 00	960 47	15
43	J. Arthur Arcand.....		453 45	40 00	493 45	9
44	F. X. Rivard.....		530 39	90 00	620 39	16
45	Joseph A. Mayrand.....	1,096 10		20 00	1,116 10	15
46	Jules Briere.....		576 48	70 00	646 48	14
47	Nap de Villers.....		690 52	70 00	760 52	17
48	Achille Gosselin.....		781 73	95 00	876 73	18
49	Armand Marchand.....		484 61	55 00	539 61	13
50	Donat Paquette.....		554 96	85 00	639 96	15
		16,413 33	19,309 74	2,570 00	38,293 07	727

The average for 18 special pilots is, \$911.85  
The average for 32 tour-de-role men is 603.43

Pilot Laurent Gauthier (No. 2 on the list) has been sick since May 27.

Pilot J. Arthur Arcand (No. 43 on the list) being sick last spring, started to work on about May 25, 1918.

